“Am I Done? Do You Like It?”
Challenging Conceptions of Quality in Children’s Artwork

2019 NAEA Boston
Diane Jaquith
Do you like it?
Do you like it?

Am I done yet?
Do you like it?
Am I done yet?
Is this good?
But I like it this way!
What is QUALITY student work?
What is **QUALITY** student work?
“The function of the overwhelming majority of your artwork is simply to teach you how to make the small fraction of your artwork that soars.”

Bayles & Orland, *Art & Fear*
What is **QUALITY** student work?

What are the **QUALITIES** of student work?
What does Art Education say about the qualities of student work?
“The goal of art education ‘is not the art itself, or the aesthetic experience, but rather the child who grows up more creatively and sensitively and applies his experience in the arts to whatever life situations may be applicable.’”

Viktor Lowenfeld, 1958, quoted in Efland, *A History of Art Education*
Imagination
Investigation
Construction
Reflection

Curiosity
Creativity and Innovation
Critical thinking and Problem Solving
Communication
Collaboration

“Success and Achievement in the Arts”
National Arts Standards  https://www.nationalartsstandards.org/content/national-core-arts-standards
Concepts of Quality Work in Art Class

Teacher Expectations
Based on
- Personal Art Experience
- Teaching Experience
- Educational Training
- Job Security

Student Expectations
Based on
- Sense of Accomplishment
- Purposeful, Meaningful Work
- Validation

School Community Expectations
Based on
- Learning Expectations
- Past Practice
- Personal Art Experience

Community Expectations
- Higher Education
- Arts Institutions
- Artists
- The Public
TEACHER EXPECTATIONS

Based on

PERSONAL ART EXPERIENCE
TEACHING EXPERIENCE
EDUCATIONAL TRAINING
JOB SECURITY

STUDENT EXPECTATIONS

Based on

SENSE OF ACCOMPLISHMENT
PURPOSEFUL, MEANINGFUL WORK
VALIDATION

SCHOOL COMMUNITY EXPECTATIONS

Based on

LEARNING EXPECTATIONS
PAST PRACTICE
PERSONAL ART EXPERIENCE
COMMUNITY EXPECTATIONS
HIGHER EDUCATION
ARTS INSTITUTIONS
ARTISTS
THE PUBLIC
Indicators of Imagination, Investigation, Construction, Reflection

- Envisioning
- Observing
- Exploring
- Practicing
- Engaging and Persisting
- Expressing
- Questioning
- Reflecting
- Connecting
Indicators of:

• Curiosity
• Creativity and Innovation
• Critical thinking
• Problem Solving
• Communication
• Collaboration
Indicators of:
• Curiosity
• Creativity and Innovation
• Critical thinking
• Problem Solving
• Communication
• Collaboration
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Art Rubric - Shading Name:</th>
<th>Excellent!</th>
<th>Pretty Good!</th>
<th>Getting there!</th>
<th>Not yet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chris</td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="3 stars" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="3 stars" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="3 stars" /></td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="2 stars" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="2 stars" /></td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="1 star" /></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning Preparation</td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="3 stars" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="3 stars" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="3 stars" /></td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="2 stars" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="2 stars" /></td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="1 star" /></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composition Arranging on the page</td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="2 stars" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="2 stars" /></td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="1 star" /></td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="1 star" /></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shading technique Consistent lighting source</td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="3 stars" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="3 stars" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="3 stars" /></td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="2 stars" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="2 stars" /></td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="1 star" /></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Artist Statement Reflect on your work</td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="2 stars" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="2 stars" /></td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="1 star" /> <img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="1 star" /></td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="1 star" /></td>
<td><img src="https://via.placeholder.com/15" alt="1 star" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“If we use VISUALIZATION as the root metaphor for the activity of assessment, assessment is then not about scaling, weighing, ranking, or rating, but about perceiving each student’s unique experiencing, making and interpreting capacities.”

Olivia Gude, Skeptical Assessment Society, 2014
Studio Thinking and the Studio Habits of Mind

Lois Hetland, Ellen Winner, Shirley Veenema, Kim Sheridan
What does Studio Thinking offer to educators?

Studio Thinking offers a lens to observe and assess thinking, decision-making, and understandings.

The Studio Habits of Mind give teachers a framework to identify strengths and growth areas, leading to strategies that can deepen learner motivation.

Studio Thinking provides teachers and students with common language to talk about artistic thinking and growth with the Studio Habits of Mind.
The Studio Habits of Mind
Envision: Imagining and Planning

*Visualize multiple possibilities for new work and next steps as the work progresses.*

I CAN picture ideas in my mind for my artwork.

I CAN prepare for my artwork with sketches and plans.

I CAN decide on next steps by asking, “What if... ?”

I CAN let my ideas change as I work.
Observe: Looking Closely

*Take time to see with care.*

I CAN notice details in the world around me.

I CAN closely view my own work to find areas to keep and to improve.

I CAN examine other artists’ artworks to get ideas.
I CAN take risks to try things I have never done before.

I CAN play with materials and techniques to discover new ways of working.

I CAN explore concepts to find new ways to express my ideas.

I CAN use my mistakes to find new ideas and to figure out where I could change how I work.

---

Stretch & Explore: Play to Discover

*What if you try something different today?*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Develop Craft: Technique</th>
<th>Develop Craft: Studio Practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I CAN use art tools and materials to practice techniques.</td>
<td>I CAN take good care of art tools and materials.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I CAN use my art-making skills to improve my artwork.</td>
<td>I CAN organize my workspace.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I CAN choose specific techniques to express my ideas.</td>
<td>I CAN put everything away in the right places.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I CAN put my work away carefully and safely.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Express: Find Meaning

*Show others what you think and feel through your artwork.*

I CAN put meaning into my artwork by including things that are important to me.

I CAN communicate my ideas through my artwork.

I CAN discover the meaning as I make my work.

I CAN interpret meaning in other artists’ artwork.
Engage & Persist: Make a commitment

When you are inspired, you will stick with your work!

I CAN connect with and commit to my work.

I CAN use my skills to go deeper with my art.

I CAN stick with my art and problem-solve when challenges come up.

I can manage my time to finish my artwork.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reflect: Question and Explain</th>
<th>Reflect: Evaluate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I CAN ask questions about my artwork in-progress.</td>
<td>I CAN reflect on what satisfies me and why.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I CAN reflect on how I’ve created my work and envision the next steps I want to take.</td>
<td>I CAN reflect on what bothers me and why.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I CAN explain my decisions to others and describe what I did.</td>
<td>I CAN reflect about how to change or improve my work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I CAN offer helpful comments to my classmates about how they could change or improve their work.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I CAN connect with other artists through their processes, techniques, stories, and ideas.

I CAN use others’ art as a resource for my own work.

I CAN discover artists’ work in my classroom, studios, art galleries, museums, and online.

I CAN collaborate with classmates to share skills and ideas.

I CAN be heard by, learn from, and compromise with my classmates on works we make together.

I AM a member of my classroom artistic community.

I AM a member of the global artistic community of all artists.
Motivation

Motivation is the engine of all genuine learning. Without it, nothing important happens. Nothing “sticks.”

Disengaged
Uninterested and uninvolved

Extrinsic
Motivated by outside approval or rewards

Intrinsic
Motivated by personal interest and curiosity

Hogan, Hetland, Jaquith & Winner. *Studio Thinking from the Start*
Working from one’s strengths feels safe and motivates disengaged students to initiate new work, take risks, and explore new ideas.
STUDENT MOTIVATION

EXTRINSIC
• Please a teacher or other adult
• Meet a deadline
• Earn a reward or grade
• Exhibition
• Develop a portfolio
• Make a gift for someone else

INTRINSIC
• Play with materials
• Practice to improve a skill
• Work with a friend
• Desire for an object, toy or game
• Communicate an idea or share knowledge and interests
• Challenge self
• Curiosity!
Caring → Motivation
Motivation → Engagement
Engagement → Persistence
Persistence → Artistic Thinking
Artistic Thinking → Quality
Student Purposes

Kids learn to chase the quality of their work.

Lois Hetland
Students learn to identify the purposes of their work

Play and explore
Practice to improve
Self-Challenge
Revisit outside interests and past art experiences

Make a functional object
Make a gift
Communicate
Play with new techniques to see what happens
Learn new skills from a friend / Teach a friend
Practice to improve technical skills
Communicate a personal value
Make a functional object: vessel, toy or game
Expand understandings about areas of interest through artmaking
Revisit past ideas
Self-challenge in kindergarten
Self-challenge in 3rd grade
Studio Thinking in the Classroom
Introduce Studio Habits explicitly

Dear Artists,

As artists work, they ENVISION what to make and how to make it.

As you picture your work in your mind, you are ENVISIONING what you will make and how you will make it.

Happy Envisioning!

Ms. Jaqueith

Dear Artists,

As artists work, they ENVISION their next steps as they picture their artwork in their minds.

Today we will stop mid-class to ENVISION by asking some “What If...” questions.

Ms. Jaqueith
Remind students when they are using a Studio Habit of Mind.

SHoM Table Reminders by Roni Rohr, teacher
Envision
Stretch & Explore

Students write what they envision for their work using “What If” questions.
Evaluate art media
Students analyze techniques by describing how they might use the technique in their own work.
Talk About the Work

Frequent conversations about the work support students as they internalize and achieve quality in their work.

- Pair-shares
- Gallery Walks and Critiques
- Artist Statements
- Student-teacher interviews
- Visits to in-school exhibits
Pair Share

Talking about an artwork with a classmate
Finished Artwork Gallery Walks
In-Process Gallery Walks

Describe    Give Advice     Ask a Question     Suggest a Title

Agusta Agustsson, Teacher
Class Share or Critique
“This is a painting about skiing and walking home and having snowball fights and walking in the dark. All those fun things to do—it’s fun but you have to stay close to home. If you are ski jumping be sure to not go on the high jump until you are older. I am going to ski when I turn 6.”
Visiting Exhibits as a Class
Part I: Consistent time to talk with peers about work

Part II: Student-teacher interviews

• How is art class going for you?
• What is your favorite artwork?
• Where do you feel you have improved?
• What is challenging for you?
• How do you deal with these challenges?
• What’s next?
Seeing two or more similar works from the same student helps me empathize when searching for what the student is learning, discovering, and/or could be learning and discovering.

Marvin Bartel
“The Art of Motivation and Critique,” in The Learner Directed Classroom
Indicators of Learning and Understanding
Develop Craft Reflect

Guided prompts for exit ticket reflections inform the teacher about students’ learning during studio time.
I learned that when you paint, you have to do it swiftly so that you feel the peace.
Develop Craft

Kindergartners tell all they know about an art process in words or drawings.
Develop Craft

First and second graders map out an artistic process in words or drawings.
Express: As the artist, I feel that my erupting volcano causes me to feel excitement. The first reason is that the colors are bright and festive. The second is that it makes you feel like you are there.
One-Point Rubric/ Habit Profile

Students fill this out to identify their strengths and growth areas and the teacher can fill this out for individual students about whom they wish to know more.
### Studio Habits of Mind Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student:</th>
<th>Studio Habits</th>
<th>Areas of Growth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Areas of Strength</strong></td>
<td><strong>G always has ideas for new characters.</strong></td>
<td><strong>Yes! G likes to explore materials to see what she can use in her art.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ENVISION</strong></td>
<td>• Imaginates multiple ideas for work • Considers next steps for WIP</td>
<td><strong>Would G consider other media or ideas for art?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>STRETCH &amp; EXPLORE</strong></td>
<td>• Plays with materials, techniques, concepts for new ways of working • Demonstrates flexible thinking</td>
<td><strong>Is G alert to influences outside of school, such as cartoons and comics?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>OBSERVE</strong></td>
<td>Observations of models, processes, the environment, other’s artwork, and life experiences are evident in artwork and conversations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DEVELOP CRAFT: Technique</strong></td>
<td>Use of media and techniques express ideas and perspectives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DEVELOP CRAFT: Studio Practice</strong></td>
<td>Takes responsibility for the studio, materials, tools, and artwork</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EXPRESS</strong></td>
<td>• Personal meaning is communicated through artwork • Awareness of audience • Interprets the work of others</td>
<td><strong>G is not yet inclined to express her perspectives through her characters?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ENGAGE &amp; PERSIST</strong></td>
<td>• Consistent focus on work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**STUDIO HABITS of MIND RUBRIC**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student:</th>
<th>Studio Habits</th>
<th>Areas of Growth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Areas of Strength</strong></td>
<td><strong>ENVISION</strong>&lt;br&gt;• Imagines multiple ideas for work&lt;br&gt;• Considers next steps for WIP</td>
<td><strong>Would G consider other media or ideas for art?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Yes! G likes to explore materials to see what she can use in her art.</strong></td>
<td><strong>STRETCH &amp; EXPLORE</strong>&lt;br&gt;• Plays with materials, techniques, concepts for new ways of working&lt;br&gt;• Demonstrates flexible thinking</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>G always has ideas for new characters.</strong></td>
<td><strong>OBSERVE</strong>&lt;br&gt;Observations of models, processes, the environment, other’s artwork, and life experiences are evident in artwork and conversations</td>
<td><strong>Is G alert to influences outside of school, such as cartoons and comics?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>G has strong skills with fibers, uses technique for her expressive characters.</strong></td>
<td><strong>DEVELOP CRAFT: Technique</strong>&lt;br&gt;Use of media and techniques express ideas and perspectives&lt;br&gt;<strong>DEVELOP CRAFT: Studio Practice</strong>&lt;br&gt;Takes responsibility for the studio, materials, tools, and artwork</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>G enjoys introducing her characters and telling stories about them.</strong></td>
<td><strong>EXPRESS</strong>&lt;br&gt;• Personal meaning is communicated through artwork&lt;br&gt;• Awareness of audience&lt;br&gt;• Interprets the work of others</td>
<td><strong>G is not yet inclined to express her perspectives through her characters?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Yes! Always!</strong></td>
<td><strong>ENGAGE &amp; PERSIST</strong>&lt;br&gt;• Consistent focus on work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Keeping Track of It All
Teachers document information from each class to plan curriculum, interventions, and to track student progress.
Students document their choice of studios each class.
Tool Books
Single-ring “books” hold Studio Habits reference cards, vocabulary, plans, thinking maps, techniques.

Dale Zalmstra and Kat Potter
Art Teachers
Collections: Tool Books
Dale Zalmstra & Kat Potter

The Tool Book “organizes and tracks work. Key goal, how to have students manage their own recordkeeping, documentation, [and] assessment [of] learning. This is best summed up as: How can students imbed their own learning and carry their learning forward so it is something that they can access in the future; how to create a touchstone to trigger memory.”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Areas of Strength</th>
<th>Studio Habits</th>
<th>Areas of Growth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Celeste, Odell, Ryan, Cam, Khalil** | **ENVISION**  
  - Imagines multiple ideas for work  
  - Considers next steps for WIP | **Cam Celeste, Caylee**  |
| **Caylee, Devon, Owen, Stephanie** | **STRETCH & EXPLORE**  
  - Plays with materials, techniques, concepts for new ways of working  
  - Demonstrates flexible thinking | **Odell, Ryan, Evan, Daisy, Cam** |
| **Khalil, Jennipher, Odell, Celeste** | **OBSERVE**  
  Observations of models, processes, the environment, other’s artwork, and life experiences are evident in artwork and conversations | **Anna, Devon, Sara, J’ai, Topher** |
| **Evan, Daisy, Cam, Anna, Khalil, Devon, Chris, Sara, J’ai, Topher, Lia** | **DEVELOP CRAFT: Technique**  
  Use of media and techniques express ideas and perspectives  
  **DEVELOP CRAFT: Studio Practice**  
  Takes responsibility for the studio, materials, tools, and artwork | **Peter, Stephanie** |
| **Tavaun, Marika** | **EXPRESS**  
  - Personal meaning is communicated | |
Make Studio Thinking Visible through Exhibition and Portfolios

Speaking the language of Studio Habits, and making it ever-visible, helps advocate for arts education and provides a bridge for this kind of thinking across subject areas.

*Studio Thinking from the Start* (Hogan, et.al.)
The Studio Habits of Mind

- Develop Craft
  - Technique
  - Studio Practice
- Engage & Persist
- Stretch & Explore
- Express
- Envision
- Observe
- Reflect
  - Question & explain
  - Evaluate
- Understand Art Worlds
  - Domain
  - Community
Something happened but you can not talk about it
but there's nothing more you want than to talk about it. In multiple instances you almost bring it up but
you don't feel you like no one

Can relate to you and you go mad and you realize
that you have become what everyone was warning you about,
You have become the monster Once Upon a Time...
Something happened but you can not talk about it
but there’s nothing more you want than to talk about it. In multiple instances you almost bring it up but
you don’t feel like no one can relate to you and you go mad and you realize that you have become what everyone was warning you about.
You have become the monster "Once Upon a Time..."
Artsonia: Online Portfolios including work in-progress
SeeSaw: Online Portfolios  (courtesy of Stacey Parrish)
SeeSaw: Online Portfolios of Student Work

Images courtesy of Stacey Parrish
2-Minute Video Walk Around the Room to be shared with administration, highlighting studio thinking in action.
Educate your School Community about the Goals of a Visual Art Education

Imagination
Investigation
Construction
Reflection
But I like it this way!

Please tell me all about your artwork! I want to know more!
Related Sessions today at NAEA:

12-1:20: Assessment: A Therapeutic Conversation and Group Reflection with Olivia Gude and Katherine Douglas
Center/Ballroom A/Level 3

2-2:50: Studio Thinking in Action in the Elementary Art Room
Ellen Winner, Jillian Hogan, Catherine "Kitty" Conde, Julie Toole, Celia Knight
Center/Meeting Room 104/Level 1

3-3:50: Using Studio Habits of Mind for Formative Assessment
Jillian Hogan, Nicole Gsell, Celia Knight, Emily Stewart, Ceara Yahn
Center/Meeting Room 306/Level 3
Diane Jaquith
dbjaquith@gmail.com

Studio Thinking
http://www.studiothinking.org/

Teaching for Artistic Behavior, Inc.
teachingforartisticbehavior.org

TAB Summer Teacher Institute
https://massart.edu/teaching-artistic-behavior-tab

Teaching for Artistic Behavior (TAB) Art Educators
TAB Facebook Group